



**METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION**

Bay Area Metro Center
375 Beale Street, Suite 800
San Francisco, CA 94105
415.778.6700
www.mtc.ca.gov

February 26, 2020

Scott Haggerty, Chair
Alameda County

Alfredo Pedroza, Vice Chair
Napa County and Cities

Jeannie Bruins
Cities of Santa Clara County

Damon Connolly
Marin County and Cities

Dave Cortese
Santa Clara County

Carol Dutra-Vernaci
Cities of Alameda County

Dorene M. Giacomini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Nick Josefowitz
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Gina Papan
Cities of San Mateo County

David Rabbit
Association of Bay Area Governments

Hillary Ronen
City and County of San Francisco

Libby Schaaf
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

Warren Slocum
San Mateo County

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

James Stracner
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tony Tavares
California State
Transportation Agency

Amy R. Worth
Cities of Contra Costa County

Therese W. McMillan
Executive Director

Alix Bockelman
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

Brad Paul
Deputy Executive Director,
Local Government Services

The Honorable London N. Breed
Mayor, City of San Francisco
City Hall
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place
San Francisco, CA 94102

The Honorable Libby Schaaf
Mayor, City of Oakland
City Hall
1 Frank H. Ogawa Plaza
Oakland, CA 94612

RE: Transbay Transit Center Peer Review

Dear Mayor Breed and Mayor Schaaf:

I write you to report the completion of the MTC-appointed Peer Review Panel's review of the investigations into the cause of fracture of the two girders at the Transbay Transit Center that were discovered in September 2018.

My last update, in June 2019, documented the Peer Review Panel's concurrence with TJPA's designer of record that the steel structure was ready for service. In that letter I noted that some aspects of the review would continue after the terminal's reopening. You may recall that the panel's scope of work was divided into several phases; ultimately these included the following:

1. Shoring capacity;
2. Sampling and testing plan;
3. Cause of failure;
4. Other areas impacted by the steel fractures;
5. Repair solution;
6. Search for other areas susceptible to brittle fracture; and
7. Review of fatigue assessment plan.

The Peer Review Panel has completed its reviews, with the conclusion from each phase documented by a letter to MTC. These letters are attached for your records. In summary, these letters state that the Peer Review Panel concurs with the cause of the fractures that was identified and the design of the repair that was used, and with the process the TJPA used to verify the rest of the steel structure was free of similar conditions that could lead to another brittle fracture.

The Peer Review Panel was not asked and does not intend to address the line of inquiry concerning which parties were responsible for the fractures, and whether the work was in compliance with code or contract provisions. Independent of that discussion, the panel believes there are lessons to be learned from what happened and that changes to code and

Mayor Breed and Mayor Schaaf
Page 2 of 2
February 26, 2020

industry standards should be made to help avoid this type of failure in the future. These are summarized in a paper MTC will post on its website and present to the American Institute of Steel Construction, responsible for publishing widely-used standards for steel construction.

I would like to recognize the work of the Peer Review Panel, led by Chair Dr. Michael Engelhardt, in leading the peer review with the thoroughness and urgency it required.

Finally, I would like to express my gratitude for your leadership through the challenges faced by the region during the closure of the Transbay Transit Center. Your call for a process that would provide public confidence and ensure the problem was isolated gave the Peer Review Panel the mandate it needed to ensure all the necessary material was gathered and reviewed.

Please do not hesitate to contact me should you have any further questions.

Sincerely,



Therese W. McMillan
Executive Director

cc:

Scott Haggerty, Chair, Metropolitan Transportation Commission
Michael Engelhardt, Chair, Peer Review Panel
Jeff Gee, Vice Chair, Transbay Joint Powers Authority
Mark Zabaneh, Executive Director, Transbay Joint Powers Authority
Ramakrishna Pochiraju, Executive Director of Planning & Engineering, AC Transit

TM: SW

J:\SECTION\EXEC\EO\Therese McMillan\Correspondence 2020\Breed_Schaaf_McMillan_TTC Peer Review_20200226.docx

Attachments